



An Bille um Chomhairle na mBreithiúna, 2017
Judicial Council Bill 2017

Meabhrán Míitheach agus Airgeadais
Explanatory and Financial Memorandum



AN BILLE UM CHOMHAIRLE NA mBREITHIÚNA, 2017
JUDICIAL COUNCIL BILL 2017

EXPLANATORY AND FINANCIAL MEMORANDUM

Purpose of the Bill

The purpose of this Bill is to establish a Judicial Council which will be independent in the performance of its functions and will promote and maintain excellence and high standards of conduct by judges. It will also provide a means of investigating allegations of judicial misconduct and, in this context, a Judicial Conduct Committee, which will have lay representation, will be established. Furthermore, it will facilitate the ongoing support and education of judges through a Judicial Studies Committee and through the establishment of Judicial Support Committees.

Provisions of the Bill

PART 1

Preliminary and General

Short title and commencement

Section 1 contains standard citation and commencement provisions.

Definitions

Section 2 contains relevant definitions which are self-explanatory. Of particular importance is the definition of “judicial misconduct” which is relevant to the system for investigating complaints against judges, which is a central element of the Bill.

Repeals

Section 3 provides for the repeal of a number of provisions which are no longer required, for example, section 21 of the Courts of Justice (District Court) Act 1946 which provides for a judicial inquiry into the condition of health or conduct of a District Court judge.

Expenses

Section 4 contains a standard provision to the effect that expenses incurred in the administration of the Act shall be paid out of moneys provided by the Oireachtas.

PART 2

Judicial Council

Establishment day

Section 5 provides that the Minister shall, by order, appoint a day to be the establishment day for the purposes of the Act.

Establishment of Council

Section 6 provides for the establishment of a Judicial Council which shall, subject to the provisions of the Act, be independent in the performance of its functions.

Functions of Council

Section 7 sets out the functions of the Judicial Council which include promoting and maintaining excellence in the exercise by judges of their judicial functions and high standards of conduct among judges. Other functions concern promoting and maintaining the efficient and effective use of judicial resources, continuing education of judges, respect for judicial independence and public confidence in the administration of justice. The Council will have all the powers necessary for the performance of its functions, including the power to delegate some of those functions to a committee. Certain functions, such as the adoption of guidelines concerning judicial conduct and ethics, are reserved to the Council.

Membership of Council

Section 8 provides that the Chief Justice shall be the chairperson of the Judicial Council, that the President of the Court of Appeal shall be its vice-chairperson and that the Council will comprise the entire judiciary.

Meetings and procedures of Council

Section 9 provides that the Judicial Council shall hold such and so many meetings as may be necessary for the performance of its functions but in each year shall hold at least one meeting, the first of which shall be held not later than three months after the establishment day. The section also deals with the quorum for a meeting, and with chairing and voting arrangements.

PART 3

Board and Committees of Council

Board of Council

Section 10 provides that there shall be a Board of the Council (the Board) which, subject to the Act, may regulate its own procedures. The election of the first elected members of the Board will take place at the first meeting of the Council.

Functions of Board

The functions which the Board shall perform, on behalf of the Council, are set out in *Section 11*. Those functions include determining policy in relation to the performance of the Council's functions, submitting proposals, recommendations or reports to the Council in relation to any of the functions of the Council, and reviewing draft guidelines concerning judicial conduct and ethics prepared by the Judicial Conduct Committee.

Membership of Board

Section 12 sets out the membership of the Board which will number eleven in total – the Chief Justice and the Presidents of each court, five elected members and one co-opted member.

Term of membership of Board

Section 13 sets out the duration of the term of membership of the Board which, in the case of an elected member, is a term of four years, renewable once.

Casual vacancies in membership of Board

Section 14 sets out how casual vacancies in membership of the Board are to be filled.

Meetings and procedures of Board

Section 15 concerns the frequency of meetings of the Board (at least four during any one year), as well as the quorum for a meeting, and the chairing and voting arrangements.

Committees of Council

Section 16 provides that the Council may establish such and so many committees as it thinks fit to assist and advise it in the performance of its functions. This provision is in addition to the Committees which are separately provided for elsewhere in the Bill – a Judicial Studies Committee (Section 17), a Sentencing Information Committee (Section 18), Judicial Support Committees (Section 19) and the Judicial Conduct Committee (Section 30).

Judicial Studies Committee

Section 17 provides for the establishment of the Judicial Studies Committee by the Council, the function of which is to facilitate the continuing education and training of judges with regard to their judicial functions.

Sentencing Information Committee

Section 18 provides for the establishment of the Sentencing Information Committee by the Council, the function of which shall be to collate information on sentences imposed by the courts, and to disseminate that information from time to time to judges and persons other than judges.

Judicial Support Committees

Section 19 provides for the establishment of Judicial Support Committees at all court levels by the Council. The function of a Judicial Support Committee shall be to advise and assist the Council in the performance of its functions under the Act insofar as matters relevant to the Court to which the Committee relates are concerned.

Remuneration and expenses of members of Board and committees

Section 20 concerns the payment of allowances for expenses to judges who are members of the Board or a committee (other than the Judicial Conduct Committee) and the payment of remuneration and allowances for expenses to lay members of committees other than the Judicial Conduct Committee.

PART 4

Staff, Funding and Accountability of Council

Secretary to Council

Section 21 provides for the appointment by the Board of the Secretary to the Council.

Functions of Secretary to Council

Section 22 sets out the functions of the Secretary which, in addition to other functions assigned under the Act, include the management and control of the staff of the Council and the administration of the Council and its committees.

Staff of Council

Section 23 concerns the appointment of staff of the Council.

Advances to Council

Section 24 concerns the provision of moneys to enable the Council perform its functions

Annual report of Council

Section 25 provides that the Council shall provide an annual report to the Minister for Justice and Equality of its activities, which the Minister shall cause to be laid before each House of the Oireachtas.

Accounts of Council

Section 26 concerns the keeping of accounts by the Council.

Accountability of Council to Public Accounts Committee

Section 27 concerns the giving of evidence by the Secretary to the Council to the Public Accounts Committee on specified matters.

Accountability of Council to other Oireachtas committees

Section 28 concerns the attendance by the Secretary before an Oireachtas committee other than the Public Accounts Committee (see section 27), or the Committee on Members' Interests of Dáil Éireann or the Committee on Members' Interests of Seanad Éireann, or a sub-committee of those Committees. By virtue of this section the Secretary will be required to account for the general administration of the Council but will not be required to account for matters such as the exercise by a judge of his or her judicial functions.

PART 5

Judicial Conduct Committee

CHAPTER 1

Application of Part

Application of Part

Section 29 concerns the application of this Part of the Act which, in general terms, applies to judicial misconduct alleged to have occurred after the commencement of this Part.

CHAPTER 2

Establishment, membership, etc., of Judicial Conduct Committee

Judicial Conduct Committee

Section 30 provides for the establishment of a Judicial Conduct Committee which, subject to the Act, shall be independent in the performance of its function to promote and maintain high standards of judicial conduct. The Committee will have a central role in considering complaints against judges and referring them either for resolution by informal means, or for formal investigation. It will also be responsible for drafting guidelines concerning judicial conduct and ethics.

Membership of Judicial Conduct Committee

Section 31 concerns the membership of the Judicial Conduct Committee which will consist of eight judges and five lay members.

Recommendations for appointment of lay members of Judicial Conduct Committee

Section 32 provides for the role of the Public Appointments Service in recommending persons who are suitable to be appointed as lay members of the Judicial Conduct Committee.

Term of membership of Judicial Conduct Committee

Section 33 sets out the duration of the term of membership of the Judicial Conduct Committee which, in the case of elected judges and lay members, is four years, renewable once.

Casual vacancies in membership of Judicial Conduct Committee

Section 34 deals with the process for filling casual vacancies arising on the Judicial Conduct Committee.

Meetings and procedures of Judicial Conduct Committee

Section 35 deals with the frequency of meetings of the Judicial Conduct Committee, as well the quorum for a meeting (five members of whom not fewer than three shall be judges and not fewer than two shall be lay members) and the chairing and voting arrangements.

Registrar to Judicial Conduct Committee

Section 36 provides for the Secretary, or another member of staff who is designated under *section 22(5)* to perform the functions of the Secretary, to act as Registrar to the Judicial Conduct Committee.

CHAPTER 3

Complaints

Complaints

Section 37 sets out the circumstances in which a complaint about alleged judicial misconduct can be made to the Registrar. Essentially that complaint may be made by any person who is directly affected by, or who witnessed, the alleged misconduct.

Time limit for making complaints

Section 38 sets out the time limit of three months within which a complaint may be made to the Registrar concerning the conduct of a judge which is alleged to constitute judicial misconduct. Provision is made for the time limit to be extended in appropriate circumstances.

Procedures of Judicial Conduct Committee relating to complaints or matters relating to judicial conduct

Section 39 concerns the specification by the Judicial Conduct Committee of procedures relating to the making and investigation of complaints, the making of determinations by it regarding complaints and the publication of its procedures.

Admissibility of complaints

Section 40 concerns the criteria for determining if a complaint is admissible. For example, it must be made by the appropriate person and it must not be frivolous or vexatious. It must also be the case that the conduct alleged could, if substantiated, constitute judicial misconduct by the judge concerned. Complaints relating to the merits of a decision in proceedings before a judge are not admissible. Where a complaint is admissible it is referred to the Judicial Conduct Committee.

Notification following determination of whether or not complaint is admissible

Section 41 provides for notification of the judge and of the complainant where a complaint is determined to be admissible or inadmissible.

Complaints Review Committee

Section 42 concerns the Complaints Review Committee whose purpose it is to review determinations that complaints are inadmissible. The Committee will comprise three members (two judges and one lay member) appointed by the Judicial Conduct Committee, all of whom will be members of that Committee.

Review of determination that complaint, or part of complaint, is inadmissible

Section 43 sets out the procedures to apply where a review is undertaken by the Complaints Review Committee of a determination that a complaint is inadmissible. A complainant has thirty days from the date of receiving the initial notification of that determination within which to seek a review.

Withdrawal of complaint under consideration by Registrar or Complaints Review Committee

Section 44 sets out the procedures to apply where a complaint which is being considered by the Registrar, or by the Complaints Review Committee, is withdrawn. In such circumstances it may be that no further action is taken. However, it is also possible to refer the matter to the Judicial Conduct Committee for a decision under section 46 as to whether or not to initiate an investigation in relation to the matter.

If judge concerned consents to reprimand by Judicial Conduct Committee before complaint is investigated

Section 45 sets out the procedures to apply if the judge who is the subject of the complaint consents to the issuing of a reprimand to him or her by the Judicial Conduct Committee before the complaint concerned is investigated. A reprimand in these circumstances may provide for the issuing of advice to the judge concerned, for the making of a recommendation that the judge concerned pursue a specified course of action, including attending a course or training of a specified type, and for the issuing of an admonishment to the judge concerned.

Investigations of judicial misconduct in absence of, or after withdrawal of, complaint

Section 46 allows for the possibility that an investigation into judicial misconduct may take place in the absence of a complaint, or where the complaint concerned is withdrawn, provided that the conditions set out in that section are satisfied.

Referral of complaint for resolution by informal means or investigation

Section 47 allows the Judicial Conduct Committee to refer a complaint for resolution by informal means or for investigation by a panel of inquiry.

CHAPTER 4

Resolution of complaints by informal means

Referral of complaint for resolution by informal means

Section 48 provides that the resolution of a complaint by informal means shall be undertaken by a designated judge or designated judges.

Resolution of complaints by informal means

Section 49 deals with some of the matters which are relevant when an attempt is made to resolve a complaint by informal means.

Report to Judicial Conduct Committee from designated judge or designated judges

Section 50 allows for the submission of reports to the Judicial Conduct Committee both where the complaint is deemed not suitable for resolution by informal means (in which case it is referred to a panel of inquiry), and where the complaint has been resolved by informal means. A report is also to be made where the complaint was not so resolved.

CHAPTER 5

Investigation of complaints

Referral of complaint by Judicial Conduct Committee to panel of inquiry

Section 51 concerns the appointment of a panel of inquiry to investigate a complaint and sets out the information to be provided to the judge and to the complainant consequent upon that appointment.

Recommendations for nomination of lay members of Panel of Inquiry

Section 52 provides for the role of the Public Appointments Service in recommending persons who are suitable to be appointed as lay members of panels of inquiry.

Nomination for appointment of lay members of panel of inquiry

Section 53 sets out the procedures for nominating lay members for appointment to panels of inquiry and the eligibility criteria for lay membership of such panels. It also provides for the Government to nominate not fewer than seven persons and not more than twelve persons to be lay members of panels of inquiry.

Appointment of members of panel of inquiry

Section 54 specifies that the Judicial Conduct Committee is to appoint three persons to be members of a panel of inquiry (two judges and one lay member). It also sets out the arrangements which will apply if a member resigns or otherwise ceases to be a member of panel of inquiry.

Conduct of investigation

Section 55 relates to the conduct of the investigation by a panel of inquiry and concerns matters such as the obtaining of documents, the holding of hearings, etc.

Powers and protections relating to witnesses and evidence

Section 56 concerns the powers, rights and privileges of a panel of inquiry in relation to the examination of witnesses, compelling the production of records and the giving of evidence. It also specifies that a person who does not cooperate with a panel of inquiry is guilty of an offence.

Failure or refusal by complainant to cooperate with panel of inquiry

Section 57 deals with the consequences of a refusal or failure on the part of a complainant to cooperate with a panel of inquiry. In such cases the Judicial Conduct Committee may direct that the investigation be discontinued, but it may also direct that it be proceeded with.

Failure or refusal by judge concerned to cooperate with panel of inquiry

Section 58 deals with the consequences of a refusal or failure on the part of the judge concerned to cooperate with a panel of inquiry, and provides for the possibility that a reprimand may be issued to the judge concerned in respect of the refusal to cooperate. The possibility to make such other recommendations as are specified in the section is also provided for.

Matter before panel of inquiry concerning health of judge

Section 59 concerns the consequences of a panel of inquiry forming the view that the conduct which is the subject of the complaint under investigation may be related to the health of the judge concerned. It allows for the possibility that the judge concerned may take remedial measures. It also allows for a recommendation to issue to the judge about the need to seek medical assistance.

If judge concerned consents to reprimand by Judicial Conduct Committee before conclusion of investigation

Section 60 concerns the consequences if the judge concerned consents to the issuing of a reprimand to him or her by the Judicial Conduct Committee before or during the investigation of a complaint by a panel of inquiry. In such circumstances the investigation may be adjourned and a report in relation to the complaint submitted to the Judicial Conduct Committee.

Withdrawal of complaint while it is being investigated by panel of inquiry

Section 61 concerns the consequences if a complaint which is being investigated by a panel of inquiry is withdrawn. It may be that no further action will be taken, or that the investigation continues.

Adjournment of investigation of complaint by panel of inquiry

Section 62 gives a panel of inquiry the power to adjourn an investigation of a complaint if it appears to it appropriate to do so.

Report of panel of inquiry submitted to Judicial Conduct Committee

Section 63 concerns the submission, on completion of an investigation of a complaint by a panel of inquiry, of its written report to the Judicial Conduct Committee setting out its findings. It specifies the content of the report and the nature of recommendations which may be made. For example, a recommendation may be to the effect that the judge concerned pursue a specified course of action, including attending a course or training of a specified type, or it may involve the issuing of an admonishment to the judge concerned.

Draft report to be sent to complainant and judge concerned

Section 64 provides that any draft report of a panel of inquiry shall be sent to the complainant and the judge concerned prior to its submission to the Judicial Conduct Committee, and for the making of submissions or requests to the panel of inquiry in relation to the non-observance of fair procedures.

Amendment of draft report

Section 65 provides that where the complainant or the judge concerned submits a statement in writing requesting a panel of inquiry to review a draft report in the circumstances set out in the section, the panel may amend the draft report to take account of the statement received, or decline to make any amendments to the draft report.

Determination of complaint by Judicial Conduct Committee

Section 66 concerns the procedure to be followed by the Judicial Conduct Committee on foot of the receipt by it of a report from a panel of inquiry. It allows for submissions to be made by the complainant or judge to the Committee in relation to the recommendations that are included in the report of the panel of inquiry. Where necessary the Committee may hold a hearing in relation to the complaint which has been investigated by a panel of inquiry to assist it in arriving at a determination regarding the complaint. In this regard the Committee may accept, with or without modification, any recommendation contained in the report submitted by a panel of inquiry. It may also reject a recommendation. Where the Committee requires the judge concerned to take any action, for instance to attend a course or training, the Committee may require the judge concerned to report to it regarding his or her compliance with the requirement.

Referral by Judicial Conduct Committee to Minister of matter relating to conduct or capacity of judge for Article 35.4 purposes

Section 67 sets out the procedures to be followed in the event that a matter relating to the conduct or capacity of a judge requires the referral of the matter to the Minister for Justice and Equality for the proposal by the Minister of an Article 35.4.1^o motion in respect of the judge concerned.

CHAPTER 6

Miscellaneous provisions relating to Judicial Conduct Committee and Panels of Inquiry

Evidence given not admissible in certain proceedings

Section 68 provides that evidence given to the Judicial Conduct Committee or a panel of inquiry is not admissible in criminal or other proceedings except in certain limited circumstances.

Proceedings to be heard otherwise than in public

Section 69 provides that, as a general principle, all proceedings relating to the investigation of complaints and related court proceedings shall be conducted otherwise than in public, and makes related provisions concerning the disclosing of evidence.

Duty to disclose substance of evidence to other witnesses, etc.

Section 70 concerns the disclosure of evidence by a panel of inquiry to witnesses and to those about whom evidence is given to a panel of inquiry.

Privileges and immunities of witnesses

Section 71 concerns the immunities, privileges and liabilities of a witness before a panel of inquiry, which are the same as apply to a witness in proceedings in the High Court.

Remuneration and expenses of members of Judicial Conduct Committee and panel of inquiry

Section 72 concerns the allowance for expenses and, where appropriate, the remuneration, of members of the Judicial Conduct Committee or of a panel of inquiry.

Annual report of Judicial Conduct Committee

Section 73 provides that the Judicial Conduct Committee shall provide an annual report to the Minister for Justice and Equality of its activities, which the Minister shall cause to be laid before each House of the Oireachtas. It also specifies some of the statistical data which are to be contained in that report.

PART 6

Miscellaneous

Power of Oireachtas to remove judge from office unaffected

Section 74 provides that nothing in this Act shall affect the operation of section 4 of Article 35 of the Constitution.

Independence of court and judicial functions

Section 75 provides that nothing in this Act shall be construed as to interfere with the performance by the courts of their functions or the exercise by judges of their judicial functions.

Restriction of Freedom of Information Act 2014

Section 76 concerns the restriction of the application of the Freedom of Information Act 2014 to certain records – essentially records held by the Judicial Conduct Committee, the Registrar, etc., in the context of investigating a complaint.

Restriction of Data Protection Act 1988

Section 77 concerns the restriction of the application of the Data Protection Act 1988 to certain data, i.e. data processed in the context of the investigation of a complaint by the Judicial Conduct Committee, the Registrar, etc.

Notification to Courts Service of decisions made and actions taken by Council

Section 78 provides for the Judicial Council to notify the Courts Service of decisions made or actions taken concerning the performance of the functions of the Courts Service.

Amendment of Courts Service Act 1998

Section 79 provides for the amendment of the Courts Service Act 1998 to take account of section 78 of this Act.

Financial implications

It is envisaged that expenditure of the order of €2.7m could be incurred during the first year of establishment of the Judicial Council, with expenditure of approximately €1.6m per annum being incurred thereafter.

*An Roinn Dlí agus Cirt agus Comhionannais
Bealtaine, 2017.*